

## **Appendix B: Benefits and Challenges of Options**

### Option 1:

#### Benefits

- The space accommodates all traffic flows including public and private vehicles as well as cyclists, bus lay-bys and pedestrians;
- The space could be improved as the setting to Marischal College and as a new place in the city centre;
- Immediate and wider area amenities are well served by public transport; and
- Maintains current level of route choice for all vehicles.

#### Challenges

- Volume of traffic stops larger outdoor events from taking place in the space;
- No means of controlling how long buses wait in the area;
- The opportunity to improve the public space is reduced;
- Relocated northbound bus stop may result in traffic queues onto Union Street;
- Likely longer term disadvantage to public transport as further Masterplan projects are introduced;
- Does not contribute to improvements for cycle facilities;
- Does not contribute to air quality improvements; and
- Does not help deliver the agreed vision of the Masterplan.

### Option 2:

#### Benefits

- Improved environment from reduced traffic and an attractive route for cyclists;
- Access to public transport enhanced;
- Opportunity to close Broad Street for larger temporary events;
- Opportunity for innovative and entertaining landscape feature, such as water, art, lighting;
- Significantly improving the setting of Marischal College;
- Setting and entrance to the City Centre Masterplan Queen Square area;
- Can control how long buses wait in the area;
- Supports aim to reduce cross city centre journeys;
- Makes cycling and walking more attractive;
- Likely to contribute to localised air quality improvements; and
- Helps deliver the agreed vision of the masterplan.

#### Challenges

- It will take time for private drivers and taxis to adjust to other routes;

- Relocated northbound bus stop may result in traffic queues onto Union Street; and
- Reduces current level of route choice for some vehicles.

### Option 3:

#### Benefits

- Enhanced year round civic space;
- Additional flexibility for events;
- Further enhanced setting of Marischal College;
- Opportunity for innovative and entertaining landscape features;
- Space to hold regular programme of events to use the space as a new place in the city centre;
- Setting and entrance to the City Centre Masterplan Queen Square Area;
- Contributes to localised air quality improvements;
- Makes walking and cycling more attractive; and
- Supports aim to reduce cross city centre journeys.

#### Challenges

- Major impact on bus users (routes and journey times) in short, medium and long term;
- Reduces current level of route choice for most vehicles;
- It will take time for private drivers and taxis to adjust to other routes;
- Options for bus routes become less available;
- Area amenities directly accessed by pedestrians, cyclists only;
- Full closure does not fit with the overall vision and aims of the masterplan;
- Significant journey time increases for bus passengers;
- Closure of key public transport corridor; and
- Lack of activity in the space when events are not taking place.